

# Findings from the ESAP2 programme: Education Sector Interventions, March 2016

## 1. Introduction

### 1.1 *The Education Sector in Ethiopia*

Ethiopia's primary education enrolment rate has doubled the last decade, with statistics showing that approximately 90% of school-aged students attend primary school (World Bank 2015). The Ethiopian government is working to further increase access to education in underserved areas and improve the overall quality of education. Ethiopia still has a very low overall literacy rate<sup>1</sup>, but as the country's children are enrolling in schools in ever greater numbers, figures are improving year on year.

The latest available data shows that youth literacy rates in 2013 were estimated to be 63% for 15-24 year old males and 47% for females of the same age (UNICEF, 2008-2012 average). In 2008, the World Bank estimated that these rates were significantly lower; 56% of young men and 33% of young women (aged 15-24) were thought to be literate.

As participation in primary schools improves and primary school completion rates go up, it is assumed that literacy rates will increase too. Primary school completion rates have improved significantly in the past two decades. In 2000, statistics show that only 23% of pupils who entered primary school completed all six years of primary education; in 2010 that figure had risen to 72.2%. UNICEF estimated that the 2008-2012 average for primary school completion reached 83.5%.<sup>2</sup>

While more children in school means great progress, it does not automatically mean greater literacy. In 2010, a Ministry of Education/USAID Early Grade Reading Assessment showed that reading skills among children in primary school grade 2 and 3 were poor: "A significant percentage of children in Grade 2 read zero words correctly." In Sidama, a group of children who took the Early Grade Reading Assessment showed that the percentage of non-readers was 69.2%. Among similar sized group of children tested in Oromia, 41.2% could not read. The test report noted: "Even in Grade 3, significant percentages of children remained non-readers. it is striking that after 3 years of school, such large proportions of children remained completely illiterate in their mother tongue."<sup>3</sup>

The report sign-posted ways in which improvements could be made: It showed the positive impact that language textbooks had on student achievement. Despite the reading assessment report 'reminder' that there is still a long way ahead towards greater literacy in Ethiopia, the

---

<sup>1</sup> Literacy rate: % of both sexes aged 15 and above: 46.7 (2011) National Human Development Report, Ethiopia, UNDP, 2015.

<sup>2</sup> UNICEF 2013, World Bank 2014.

<sup>3</sup> For Somali (21.4%), Amhara (17.0%), Sidama (54.0%), and Oromia (20.6), from Piper, B. (RTN International), 2010, Ethiopia Early Grade Reading Assessment, Data Analytic Report: Language and Early Learning. USAID, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia.

Ministry of Education pushes on with its endeavour to improve both the quantity and quality of education, setting itself ambitious goals in Ethiopia's Growth and Transformation Plan.

## 1.2 The Ethiopia Social Accountability Programme-Phase 2

The ESAP2 programme has been working on the improvement of basic services in Ethiopia since the programme's inception in 2012. Social Accountability is a process by which ordinary citizens - who are the users of basic public services – voice their needs and demands and create opportunities to hold policy makers and service providers accountable for their performance. The process aims to improve the quality of and access to public basic services. Working with 49 Social Accountability Implementing Partners (SAIPs), the programme has been implemented in 223 woredas in five key sectors: health, education, agriculture, rural roads and water and sanitation.

In total, 42 SAIPs chose to engage themselves in the education sector, targeting 95 woredas, and a total of 297 schools. By December 2014, social accountability projects received the contributions from different sources to achieve the following results in the education sector:

Type of result	#	Type of contribution		
		Community (cash & in kind)	Government	Others (e.g. NGO, private sector)
Additional class rooms built(#)	153	1,962,530.00	5,973,807.00	3,748,972.00
Additional qualified teachers recruited(#)	269	72,000.00	3,497,158.00	150,000.00
Separate toilets for girls & boys built(#)	67	374,400.00	971,125.00	508,000.00
Drinking water in the school constructed / maintained (#)	46	154,400.00	737,000.00	125,650.00
More text books provided (#)	45,117	18,800.00	934,916.00	54,772.00
Additional student chairs / benches procured (#)	3,585	151,525.00	1,992,285.00	284,500.00
School fence built /repaired (#)	32.04	451,553.00	305,150.00	0.00
Purchase of laboratory equipment, computers, renovation of class rooms, construction of teachers residence		198,725.00	159,768.72	371,000.00
<b>Total Education</b>		<b>3,383,933.00</b>	<b>14,571,209.72</b>	<b>5,242,894.00</b>

This report will provide a brief overview of the key findings that have emerged from ESAPs' engagement in the education sector. The report highlights some of the most common problems identified by service users during the SA process and shows the main trends that have emerged from the reports and monitoring visits to the SAIPs that are working in the education sector.

## 2 The solution patterns identified through ESAP2

When we look at the themes that emerge from the M&E reports and case studies collected from the SAIPs that are active in the education sector, we notice that there are a number of similarities in the way education sector problems present themselves and in type of solutions that were found. Visualised in a graph, we see that the communities where SA interventions focused on the education sector prioritised the construction of additional classrooms, toilets and the provision of water. The restoration or purchase of desks, new textbooks and the construction of a school compound fence were also important.

*Figure 1, below, shows the full range of interventions that were reported by our SAIPs, while annex 1 contains a list of all SAIPs and which service improvements they reported.*

The narrative reports produced by SAIPs have allowed us to identify the following trends in terms of *how and why certain improvements were prioritised* (i.e. some improvements were decided upon because it allowed a school to meet the standard, while in other cases an increased awareness of vulnerable groups led to service improvements for children with special needs). SAIPs reported a range of activities that were implemented after SA interventions took place, they can be grouped into nine categories:

1. Knowing and meeting 'the standard' in education: SA leads to physical school improvements and additional staff & staff training
2. SA leads to improvements in cross-sectoral issues such as water supply, toilet construction and access to electricity in some schools
3. SA leads to the empowerment of Parent Teacher Associations, engaging communities and improving relationships between key school actors – students-teachers and school administration
4. SA helps to improve vulnerable children's access to education
5. SA leads to the greater awareness of the challenges faced by girl students
6. SA addressed the standard of teaching and educational attainment
7. SA assists in addressing teacher absenteeism
8. Improving education in remote locations through SA
9. Sustaining SA through SA clubs in schools

The following section will provide further details and case study examples of the main SA trends in the education sector:

## 2.1 Knowing and meeting ‘the standard’ in education: SA leads to physical school improvements and additional staff & staff training

All SAIPs started their SA interventions in the education sector by raising the community’s and the service providers’ awareness about the standards of service delivery the government of Ethiopia has set for each of the public sectors. In the education sector, there are standards for the amount of teachers per student, amount of students per classroom, amounts of textbooks and desks per student, etc. The standards are easy to understand and give both service users and service providers an objective goal to aim for. Every education facility that was part of ESAP2’s interventions was found ‘not meeting the standard’ in some area of service, the discrepancies varied from place to place:

MLYAM reported that in Minjar Shenkora Woreda, service providers from Bolo secondary school have indicated that **the school is able to meet the standard** on secondary school education as a result of the SA project. AMUDAEAS, on the other hand, faced some serious challenges. In one of the target schools, the student-teacher ratio was 1:150, while the standard is 1: 50, which made it difficult for teachers to teach the children properly. At another school AMUDAEAS encountered shortage of text books, 1 book was shared between 3 students, while each desk and chair was shared between 4 or 5 pupils (when student:book and student:desk ratio are supposed to be 1:1 and 1:2 respectively). A lack of classrooms meant that more than 70 students shared one class.

*“Now I am service provider,  
but if tomorrow I go somewhere  
I will be service user”*

Teacher in Arada sub city,  
woreda 01, Addis Ababa (HIDA)

By the end of December 2014, the schools that were targeted by the SA intervention had recruited a total of 269 additional teachers. Almost every SAIP that worked in the education sector mentioned that additional staff was hired as a result of the SA engagement. KMG mentioned that “previously, teachers were not assigned based on the total number of students. Now, the student – teacher ratio has been met as per the standard.” Not only were many new teachers hired, many existing staff in communities where AFD, ODA, CFAFI, AMUDAEAS operated, were also given the opportunity to upgrade their teaching qualifications.

The assessment of schools against the standards led to the construction of at least 153 classrooms (according to ESAP2’s own December 2014 research). In places where no additional classrooms were needed, the SA process often led to much needed renovations. MSCFSO reported that in Gotera Kebele, 4 classrooms are repaired and painted with an estimated cost of ETB 12,500. Not only this, but 26 windows and doors were repaired so that students are now getting education services in attractive classrooms. School furniture has been repaired or refurbished in almost every single school. To meet the standards, additional desks/tables/chairs were bought to ensure that each student has a space to sit and to put her or his textbooks.

*ADCS: “Compared to other  
sectors, the government service  
standard for education is  
unambiguous.”*

The large majority of schools engaged in SA activities tackled the shortage of textbooks, while in some schools libraries were constructed, librarians hired and/or significant consignments of reference books bought for the school library. MfM noted that books could finally be distributed to schools now that librarians had been recruited, while KMG remarked that since SA, the library in Tunto high school is opened on weekends as well.

Laboratory services were similarly enhanced in many schools, some SAIPs reported the hiring of laboratory staff while others noted the purchase of laboratory equipment and chemicals needed to operate the labs.

It is not only classrooms and teaching facilities that have been added, in order to improve the learning environment throughout the country. In the large majority of schools, sports fields and play grounds have also received a make-over. EWLA reported that in Kotari primary school the community obtained funds from the NGO Plan International to construct a dining room for the students. LIA reported that more than 150,000 seedlings were planted in the school compounds throughout Adaba woreda, Ajerssa Muniditu with the involvement of communities and students.

Not in every location was the improvement of the school facilities a straight forward task: APAP noted that “for the renovation of one of the schools, squatters in the school compound had been moved.”

### ***Increased budget awareness***

ADCS: It was explained that the budget was already allocated for certain issues, but it was not spent. The school administration emphasized that the only income of the school is community contribution. However, the meeting hall was constructed by contribution of the government, and the school administration and the community have limited awareness on the utilization of school grants.

CFAFI: The kebele SAC member said “*This NGO has helped us to ask what our budget is spent on and how it is spent.*”

## ***2.2 SA leads to improvements in cross-sectoral issues such as water supply, toilet construction and access to electricity in some schools***

Many school facilities did not meet the standard when it came to offering students proper girls’ and boys’ toilet facilities and running water, some lacked electricity to run their laboratories. Tackling these issues at woreda level is not always easy, because it requires the education, water & sanitation offices and electricity suppliers to work together, at times having to agree on a shared budget. During SA interventions, many such problems were overcome because individuals from a variety of woreda offices were brought together.

Over half of all the SAIPs reported tackling both water and toilet access in several of the schools they targeted. In most cases, the additional facilities increased the cleanliness and reduced open defecation. The additional toilets were often added to segregate boys’ facilities from girls’ facilities, adding privacy for girls who were reported to have found it difficult to use the facilities at all. One school constructed a sanitation room where girls can refresh during their menstrual period, while another decided to make the already existing First Aid room available for the same purpose. Many schools also constructed toilets that are accessible to children with special needs.

Having access to water is crucial in schools for drinking, keeping schools clean and allowing children to wash their hands after using the toilets. Many schools were found to have little or no access to running water, due to a lack of a water mains connection or no well or borehole. In addition, those schools that did have a water connection were often found to have broken taps or not enough taps to allow children to have a drink during break time.

MSCFSO's report noted the following: *"Yewula primary school was not getting clean water due to two major problems: Firstly, the pump was damaged and secondly, the water source had not been treated with chlorine for years. After SA, the service providers and users discussed the issue and they have now maintained the school's water point by treating it with chlorine. A new pump will soon be installed. In Amariyewobesh Kebele, the primary school was not getting a clean water supply at all. But since SA, a borehole has been constructed and it is ready for use."*

MfM reported that the community completed the installation of a water pipe to connect to the water tank – ETB 15,000 (contribution of ETB 8 per student).

EIFDDA reported that tap water was totally absent in all the 6 targeted schools of Kersa and Tiro Afteta Woredas. However, construction started at Dimtu high school, others will follow. Lack of water provision in schools is not only a rural problem, EWLA reported that the communities they supported in Addis Ababa also prioritised the issue, with some great success: *"The Bole Sub City office allocated an additional budget of ETB 210,000 for the installation of water systems (mainly water pipes and construction of water points) in an effort to provide access to water supply for Weregenu Primary School, Woreda 12."*

Many other SAIPs reported that the schools they targeted had installed water facilities. SOS Sahel noted that "tap water for laboratory and kindergarten students was installed, and that a generator was purchased by the government to pump water to schools. ODA and ADCS also reported that the purchase of a generator was high on the priority list for the schools they targeted.

### Computer facilities

EIFDDA: 140 computers were purchased for the 6 targeted schools; 80 for Tiro Afta and 60 for Kersa Woreda. This was the result of networking and collaboration between the Jimma Zone education office, EIFDDA and 'Camara Ethiopia' – an NGO working on educational resources (computer hardware and learning centre enhancement scheme). Jimma Zone education office contributed ETB 1,085 as a matching fund for each computer. ICT rooms which can accommodate the new computers were provided with rehabilitated tables, chairs and fans. Moreover, Camara Ethiopia provided the relevant computer literacy training to ICT teachers at the two schools.

### 2.3 SA leads to the empowerment of Parent-Teacher Associations, engaging communities

Throughout Ethiopia there are already existing citizen feedback mechanisms in place for the education sector called Parent-Teacher Associations (PTAs). While some PTAs were found to work well, in many other cases, the SAIPs working in the education sector encountered PTAs

that stopped having meetings or had simply ceased to exist when members had left (teachers transferred or parents of children who graduated had stopped being active contributors), no new members had been appointed.

AFD reported “Absence of functional parent teachers association.” TYA noted “Weak PTA relationship and low community involvement” and MSCFSO stated “Malfunctioning of established committees such as PTA, PTSA, top student association, class monitor association to support the teaching learning process. Loose relationship of most school administrators with the existing community based organizations.” In a different school, MSCFSO noted: “The school’s administration is not creating awareness about schools’ expenditure to the community, and the PTSA is not working properly and they are not meeting monthly.”

While the restoration of community-school relationships is not a costly investment, such as the construction that has upgraded school facilities, it is a very important action, which many SAIPs undertook. In many cases SAIPs found that the newly revived PTAs were key actors in the implementation of the Joint Action Plans, and will be key to the sustainability of SA in the education sector.

*MSCFSO’s report noted the following achievements: “One of the basic problems that hindered the education service was the absence of parent - school relations. This was raised as a problem in North Achefer Woreda. In order to solve this problem, parents, teachers and the Woreda education office started to meet on a monthly basis and discuss education-related service problems raised during the SA focus groups discussions. During a regular parent - school meeting, the school principal presented the annual budget and the monthly income and expenditure of the school to attending parents and the administration body. The parents were surprised by the change they observed and now feel confident to contribute to the school, after having known how much the annual income of the school is, and how it will be spent.”*

Many other SAIPs have reported improved ‘school-community-authority relationships’:

ODA: *“Change from weak community-based school committees to active groups who manage and follow up to discharge responsibilities.”*

KMG: *“The sense of ownership among the community has increased, two toilet blocks were constructed with citizens’ contribution, but that is not the only type of engagement. Transparency and better relationships have been created between service providers and citizens. The community has increased knowledge about service standards, and better awareness about woreda budget.”*

EWLA: *“We have seen improvement in students’ performance as stakeholders learnt from SA .... The school compound fence construction has started. In general, we see **increased***

### **Monitoring construction**

KMG: Before, the community did not have a sense of ownership over the school facilities, but now the community ‘owns’ them and follows up: e.g. during the construction of toilets, the community noticed that the contractor utilized poor materials and demanded a change! Due to the involvement of the community, quality toilets were constructed.

**community participation** in school matters, as the community realizes they cannot wait for the government and the administration to be solely responsible. At the same time, the SA process has awoken the education authorities to hear the demands of citizens. To this end 24 teachers have been assigned and frequent transfer of teachers has stopped. Teachers are becoming punctual and the school administration has increased supervision of support staff to discharge their responsibilities.”

Overall, the SAIPs report that when communities become engaged in a positive way, the authorities and school administrations become more transparent, both about what they can do, and also what they cannot. When authorities openly state what they lack, the community can sometimes help. LIA reported that *“the communities have contributed ETB 300,000 for the purchase of 6 motor cycles which were then provided to the Adaba Woreda Education Office for supervision experts.”*

#### 2.4 SA helps to improve vulnerable children’s access to education

SA’s focus on the vulnerable in society has helped to establish greater access to education for many groups throughout Ethiopia. SAIPs focussing on education have reported that many education facilities have upgraded their compounds so that classrooms and toilets are now accessible to those who are in a wheelchair or use crutches. A number of schools have started to offer special classes for children who are visually impaired. The SA interventions have not only helped to create facilities that children with special needs can access, it has also helped to remove the stigma of disability, with many more parents reportedly sending their children to school for the first time, as they realize that their children are welcome.

Other vulnerabilities, faced by children as living in absolute poverty or without parents, have also been tackled in a number of cases. Communities have been reported as raising funds to pay for school uniforms for children whose parents cannot afford to buy them. In other places the school grant for disadvantaged children is being reassessed or broadened to ensure that those who need it most receive it.

There are many heart-warming stories of schools and communities who have made it possible for vulnerable children to access education for the first time.

SOS Sahel reported that the Addis Hiwot program for visually impaired has been started. The SAIP added: *“It was explained to us that before, families were hiding their disabled children in the house. But now they are sending them to school and participating in social activities.”*

MSCFSO: *“Two special needs education units (for 15 & 17 students) opened at Metaya and Felegebirhan Kebeles. This was the result of SA, which solved a key problem: Schools could not provide special needs education because there was no registered demand for such facilities, and parents of students with special needs were unwilling to register and send their children to school- as there were no dedicated facilities! After discussions with stakeholders, parents signed an agreement not to hide children during registration. Iddir representatives were ‘special actors’ during the students’ registration period, and as a result, the government was able to open special needs education centres.”*

LIA: *It was explained that due to awareness creation, more girls and disabled students are attending school now. The school is accessible for disabled students, as there are ramps installed. Parents have started to allow their children with disabilities to go to school. This attitudinal change is the result of SA intervention. Even in Leliso primary school, the government has employed teachers for those students who cannot see and hear to provide special needs education.*

Many other SAIPs have mentioned the installation of ramps and the levelling of the grounds to improve wheelchair access and the construction of ‘disability friendly toilet facilities’. At Negus Teklehaimanot School in Debre Markos (ADA) piles of rubble were excavated and the school compound was levelled to create disability friendly environment. Several other SAIPs have noted additional measures to accommodate special educational needs: the recruitment of a special needs teacher (UEWCA and MSCFSO), purchase of dedicated educational material and the availability of financial support to parents with children who have special needs (MSCFSO).

In order to create access to education for children who are orphaned or from poor families, several SAIPs noted that government support was now made available, such as KMG: “Students from poor and vulnerable families as well as those that have lost their parents got educational material support” and EIFDDA: “Previously, the school grants were mostly mishandled, but now the zonal level education office wants to apply SA to ensure the proper utilization of school grants in accordance with the needs of community.”

## **2.5 SA leads to the greater awareness of the challenges faced by girl students**

Every Ethiopian child has the right to a basic standard of primary and secondary education. There are many hindrances girl students face in their journey to access education, which are often overlooked. During the SA community discussions about the quality and accessibility of the local education services, many such issues were highlighted, and addressed, for the first time. SAIPs reported many frank discussions about harassment, early marriage and about girls’ need for greater access to sanitary pads and a private place to deal with their menstrual cycle, which stops many girls from attending secondary school.

While many of the measures reported on in the section highlight the benefits for girls, many of the benefits are also extended to boys. A great number of SAIPs reported that the construction or repair of a perimeter fence has been high on the list of many communities and school administrations, in order to enclose school compounds and protect students from individuals (and animals) who have no reason to be in the school compound. Almost an equal number of SAIPs reported the construction of additional toilets so that separate girls’ and boys’ toilet blocks could be created, some distance apart.

On several occasions was the harassment of girl students on their way to and from school highlighted. The head of the Woreda Education Office in Addis Ababa Woreda 3, admitted in an interview that these issues would not have been noted and addressed if it had not been for the SA process. “In the education sector we have an extensive checklist which looks at the standard of education provided. The SA process allowed us to look beyond that and take action to protect our students.”

The SA process led to the relocation of bars, chat shops and taxi ranks at which men congregate and create an unsafe environment for students:

ADA: *“In Abema School, a total of ETB 420,000 was endorsed by the woreda to relocate local bars and chat houses inside the school compound, which posed the risk of harassment and was generally disruptive of the teaching-learning process (it has to be stressed that the bars ended up inside the school compound due to the extension of the school to several premises in the same general area). ADA noted that the same school tackled other issues which put girls off from coming to school: Absence of separate toilets for girls, a lack of counselling services for female students. This led to the construction of many separate facilities, including a reading room for female students. The school also increased the awareness among school staff, including guards, about the need to protect girls from harassment.”*

EWLA: *“Woregenu School in Bole Bulbula managed to hire buses to take students to and from exam centres for grade 8 national exams, which reduced the risk of abduction of girls which is rampant around the area. PTSA with the help of EWLA have been following up on a court case of one abducted girl identified during interface meeting.”*

UEWCA: *“The Akaki Kality Woreda SAC members, in collaboration with the PTA and police, made an effort to close the “shisha bet” around the Hibret Chibo school to make the learning and teaching process peaceful and let the students be free from addiction. HIDA also reported that the local authorities relocated two chat shops that were beside the school.”*

EWLA: *“At Kotari primary school (Addis Ababa, Woreda 11), a school map was prepared and the taxi station located in front of the school gate has been shifted to another area. At a different school, EWLA noted: shisha/drug houses located around the school created disturbances and caused harassment of female students. The shops are now closed and replaced with other businesses. At the remote Woregenu primary school, Addis Ababa Woreda 12, the woreda and school administration made transportation services available to reduce female students' harassment on the way to exam stations during 8th grade regional examination.*

### **Girly solutions**

KMG: Tunto high school managed to obtain 218 free sanitary pads for girls at school from UNICEF and more are planned to be purchased with the school budget

HIDA: Service improvements focusing on gender perspective are taking place. For example, the first aid room is open to girls during their menstrual period.

*The protection of girls needs to be continued both inside the school as well as outside, as YMCCD highlighted: Alemgena elementary school was located within the same compound as Wato secondary school. The SA process uncovered a repeated complaint raised by parents who feared that their girls at the elementary school were being exposed and abused by older boys of the high school. After the interface meeting, both schools have been separated by a fence, which was quickly established with iron sheeting delivered by the Kebele administration.”*

SA interventions led to greater efforts being made by all stakeholders to **encourage parents to keep their girls in school:**

NEWA: *“Discussions with Schools Social Accountability Clubs, education board members, students and parents are ongoing to promote girl's education and reduce early drop-out rates among girls.”*

MSCFSO: *“In the past we saw an increased drop out of female students due to early marriage and the unsuitable learning environment. Most parents were reluctant to send their girls to school.”* ADV: *“Dropout students are brought back. Parents are treating female and male children who are students equally.”*

MLYAM: *“A school in Bologiorgis Kebele is proud that they have established a taskforce drawn from police, school administration and civic education team in response to **‘bad student behaviour, which is negatively affecting the teaching and learning process’**. A room is assigned in the school for the task force to discharge its responsibilities. Since the SA process the school decided to reinstate the club that supports girls to get sanitary pads and access to showers which prevents girls from dropping out of school’. They have also rearranged a place in the school to start kindergarten, using the school’s own budget.”*

## 2.6 SA addresses the standard of teaching and educational attainment

The SA interventions in the education sector have clearly provided an opportunity for citizens to interrogate not only the quality of the teaching facilities but also the quality of the teaching standard and the resulting educational attainment of the students. SAIPs have reported on a number of misgivings:

WCAT: *“Citizens complained bitterly during focus group discussions that the quality of education is below standard: children who are passing 4th grade are not able to read and write.”* UEWCA: *“Students explained that teacher's behaviour has improved; now they allow students to speak.”* ECC-SDCO: *“Schools routinely allow complete promotion of students at lower grades, making children pass from one class to another without having basic reading and writing skills.”*

The SAIPs reported numerous changes that were made to improve teaching standards and learning outcomes:

MSCFSO: *“Tutorials are now being given in all schools where ESAP2 was implemented. Parents and the school community have started monthly discussions about improving the quality of education. Following these discussions, teachers have selected slow learning students and started giving extra tutorial classes for them.”*

KMG: *“Students began to follow-up and inform school administrators about teachers' attendance, jointly solve issues when disputes arise between teachers and students. A good example is the students of Mandoya School, who managed to investigate the case when one of their teachers decided not to teach the whole class because of one misbehaving student. Students also demanded transparency when their exam results were unfairly reduced. The school administration changed student disciplining mechanisms. In the past students were sent off when they behaved badly. Instead students will have to make extra study work and presentations.”*

LIA: *“The government has employed teachers who have a BA/BSc diploma. To improve the teaching quality, the government has provided short-term training courses for teachers in the summer. This year, 65% of the Woreda budget is allocated to the education sector.”*

VECOD: *“Some of the service improvement results in the education sector in Gambella include teachers getting their salaries on time and at their kebeles instead of traveling to the zone which is time consuming and often caused delay resulting in frustration. The teachers now receive grade and step promotions, which had been pending for many years.”*

EWLA: *“A teacher attending the meetings indicated that the SA project is very helpful in solving many of the problems they have in their school. He indicated that the library is now well stocked and more teachers are recruited, which is easing the burden of the existing teachers. Teachers are now assigned to teach the subjects in which they are trained, in the past they were obliged to teach subjects they were randomly assigned to.”*

### *Improved drop-out rates*

As a result of school improvements, a range of SAIPs noted a decrease in school drop-out rates (students who are registered in school but who do not attend).

AMUDAEAS: *“In Wahil, Koriso and Hululmojo kebeles of Wahil Cluster in Dire Dawa, school dropout rates for both girls and boys have decreased. There are now student clubs that promote good discipline and improve academic performance. Teachers turn up with well-prepared lesson plans, and student and teacher absenteeism from school has been drastically reduced.”*

ODA: *“The drop-out rate of students has decreased, due to creating conducive environment in the school (planting trees in the school). More awareness was created through the 1 to 5 network.”*

WCAT: *“The increased women’s participation in established school committees helped to bring back ‘dropped-out students’. As a result, the student drop-out rate this year has been reduced to zero percent.”*

EIFDDA: *“Beyond the physical school enhancement, school drop-out rates, which were identified as a serious problem, decreased from 5% to less than 2% after SA intervention. ECC-SDCO: Dropout reduced from 6% to 2.1% due to the change in the school environment. Particularly the female drop-out rate decreased and girls’ enrolment rates increased, due to continuous SAC sensitization. Sufficient text books and desks are now to the standard.”*

## **2.7. SA assists in addressing teacher absenteeism**

One of the issues that many of the SAIPs noted was the problem of teacher absenteeism, which is highlighted separately, as it was a frequent complaint:

TYA mentioned: *“Teachers’ ethics problems, especially absenteeism. MSCFSO: Teachers are not living around the school compound which makes them to start class late. Teachers are not fully attending their class.”*

In a number of cases, teacher absenteeism was identified as being linked to the distances teachers need to travel to get to school. Teacher accommodation and other teacher's facilities were constructed to ensure greater attendance.

MSCFSO: *"In Kualabaka Kebele, 8 additional teachers' residence rooms were constructed at an estimated cost of ETB 79,150. As a result, teachers are not wasting time travelling longer distances. MSCFSO also noted: Teachers had no latrine rooms in the schools. In order to solve this problem, community members have constructed teachers' latrine rooms with an estimated cost of ETB 133,555. In Woyira Kebele, Enemay Woreda 10 teachers' residence rooms and a teachers' toilet were constructed by both the community and government, at a cost of ETB 37,050."*

MfM: *"Teachers arrive on time for class, because teachers now live in the kebele. There is a plan to construct houses for teachers by the community." ECC-SDCO also noted that "Houses for teachers and DA are being constructed in Awa Babo and Arere Kebeles."*

## **2.8 Improving education in remote locations through SA**

SA interventions have been implemented all around the country, including in some remote locations, where service standards are less frequently met.

VECOD targeted several schools in Gambella, where it encountered a myriad of challenges: *"The focus group discussions identified the following: Lack of water and toilets in schools, a shortage of classrooms and a shortage of desks and no fences around some of the schools. The teachers are not motivated due to a lack of benefits, promotion and attention from the education authorities. There seems to also be a shortage of budget for schools."*

Some of the achievements it lists are: *"In Itang, two schools were fenced with resources mobilized from the government and citizens. The PTSA has now become functional again and it engages parents. The community managed to mobilize resources from an NGO to support needy children with school materials and clothes. In Abol, we have seen an improved citizen – government relationship, and a teachers' residence under construction."*

Sustaining progress is not always easy. The SAIP also reported: *"The follow-up by both the kebele and woreda SAC is very limited in Gambella town. As a result, a water point constructed with the contribution of citizens in one of SA intervention schools is broken and no longer functional."*

## **2.9 Sustaining SA through SA clubs in schools**

The SA concept has been well received by the schools and the communities that have been involved. SAIPs report that in many cases, teachers and students have formed SA clubs, where messages such as 'giving honest service feedback' and 'taking responsibility for your own school' have resonated:

WCAT reported: *"The SA club has its own forum at the school and once a month, they will perform drama and poems. They set their own agenda, which will be implemented by the students. The SA club members advise students who misbehave in class. One member explained during the review meeting that before he disturbed the class, but after joining the*

*SA club, he has changed his behaviour. Now he is advising other students who misbehave in classes. This has reduced bad student behaviour (some students had group fights and were damaging school properties)."*

MLYAM is working to strengthen community based organizations and school SA clubs. The establishment of 22 school SA clubs and SA awareness in Iddir unions are stepping stones with regards to long term service improvement.

*ADCS: "In Sasun kebele, a SA student club is established by initiative of teachers in October 2014. The SA student club raises awareness among other students; they read poems and organize drama on parent's day. The woreda coordinator trained the student club and has followed up on their activities." ADA noted: "Schools have also started creating awareness among students, teachers and other staff. SA clubs have been established in 14 additional schools (9 in Debre Markos, 2 in Fogera and 3 in Ebinat); and SL: "SA clubs established in all intervention Woredas in 32 schools (8 schools in each Woreda)."*

### 3 Conclusions

Social Accountability interventions in the education sector have contributed to a significant amount of improvements in schools, in the school environment and in the relationships between the Woreda education offices, PTAs, the wider community, teachers and students. As this report has shown, SAIPs have witnessed that in many schools the infrastructure and the teaching quality has been upgraded. Evidence suggests that there are many more education facilities throughout the country that could benefit from SA. ESAP2 has seen reports of Woreda officials who have already started to extend SA practices to other schools within their catchment area.

One key factor that has contributed to so many successful improvements has been a greater awareness of 'the standard'. The Government of Ethiopia has set unambiguous standards for the delivery of education and 'knowing the standard' has helped many communities, PTAs, teachers and local officials to set clear targets to meet these goals.

Many SAIPs have reported communities' strong focus on the quality of teaching and learning. Case studies have shown that the SA process has been beneficial in creating a kinder learning environment in places where communication between teachers and students had broken down, and it has made much needed skills upgrading courses available to more teachers. The recruitment of many additional teachers has also improved the student-teacher ratio. The many communities that questioned local education officials about the levels of literacy their children achieved have been rewarded with additional tutorials and promises that students will not be moved on to the next grade unless they acquire basic reading and writing skills.

SA has also brought the issue of harassment of students and the need for a safe school environment to the fore. The relocation of multiple alcohol or chat vendors and taxi stands which were too close to schools are evidence that communities and authorities can work positively together to ensure that a safe learning environment can be created for all Ethiopian children.

Improving education facilities can be a costly endeavour. It has been noted that some communities or officials have been able to reach out to NGOs and UN agencies in order to access funds for the construction of education facilities. In future, such links could potentially be facilitated across the board, so that more communities in need of funds can be linked to agencies that have dedicated themselves to support a certain sector.

## Annex 1: Tally of education results\*

Changes	SAIPs	Tally
Additional classrooms	HFC, IWCIDA, HFC, MSCFSO, ODA, ASRO, APAP, ADCS, MENA, RCWDO, SWDA, AEPA, EWLA, Amudaeas, ECC-SDCO, OWDA, UEWCA, LIA, MfM, JeCCDO, EIFDDA, ADCS, CF-AI, ADV, MLYAM, RCDE, WAT	28
Additional teachers	ADV, LIA, HFC, MSCFSO, ODA, ADA, KMG, JeCCDO, OWDA, EIFDDA, ADCS, CF-AI, RCWDO, AEPA, EWLA, MLYAM, YMCCD, RTG	18
Teacher training/skills upgrading	LIA, AFD, ODA, CF-AI, Amudaeas, MSCFSO	6
Additional desks/tables/chairs	CFID, OWDA, JeCCDO, HFC, AFD, RTG, KMG, MENA, ADV, SWDA, AEPA, EWLA, YMCCD, ECC-SDCO, ADCS, IWCIDA, MSCFSO, ODA, EWLA, MLYAM, Amudaeas, AFD, IWCIDA, RTG, WAT	25
Text books	CFID, EIFDDA, OWDA, JeCCDO, MSCFSO, LIA, ADCS, SOS Sahel, IWCIDA, MfM, KMG, ADCS, CF-AI, AEPA, EWLA, MLYAM, Amudaeas, YMCCD, AFD, RTG, WAT	21
Library	LIA, UEWCA, SOS Sahel, MSCFSO, ODA, KMG, EIFDDA, ADCS, AEPA, Amudaeas	10
Library books	ADCS, UEWCA, MfM, KMG, MSCFSO, EIFDDA, ADV, EWLA, HIDA, MLYAM, YMCCD	11
Laboratory	ADCS, UEWCA, KMG, SOS Sahel, MSCFSO, HFC, ODA, APAP, ADA, EIFDDA	10
Laboratory equipment/materials	ADCS, MSCFSO, MfM, EIFDDA, HIDA, IWCIDA, WSA	7
Computers	ADCS, EIFDDA, ADCS, YMCCD	4
Sports field improvement/equipment	ADCS, KMG, IWCIDA, MfM, APAP, EIFDDA, HIDA, Amudaeas, YMCCD	9
Playground improvement	IWCIDA, MSCFSO, ADA, KMG, APAP, EIFDDA	6
Beautification school compound	ODA, ADA, KMG, LIA,	4
Kindergarten/preschool started	MSCFSO, ODA, MfM, UEWCA, MLYAM	5
Title deed for school ground/building	HFC	1
Bridge constructed to improve access to school	SWDA	1
Water provision	ADCS, EIFDDA, JeCCDO, UEWCA, MfM, HFC, AFD,	26

Changes	SAIPs	Tally
	TYA, ODA, ADA, RTG, ADCS, ADV, RCWDO, EWLA, Amudaeas, YMCCD, ECC-SDCO, SOS Sahel, EIFDDA, MSCFSO, VECOD, HIDA, MLYAM, RTG, WSA	
Additional toilets	ADCS, LIA, OWDA, JeCCDO, UEWCA, HFC, SOS Sahel, TYA, MSCFSO, WCAT, ADA, ASRO, RTG, EIFDDA, ADCS, RCWDO, EWLA, Amudaeas, YMCCD, ECC-SDCO, ODA, KMG, APAP, HIDA, RTG, WAT, WSA	27
Electricity	ADCS, ODA, SOS Sahel, ADCS	4
PTA strengthened	MSCFSO, ODA, UEWCA, VECOD, Amudaeas, RCDE	6
Greater community engagement	KMG, ODA, SOS Sahel, HFC, MSCFSO, WCAT, UEWCA, EIFDDA, EWLA, MLYAM, Amudaeas, ECC-SDCO, AFD, RCDE	14
Adult/informal education for parents + school drop outs reinforces need to keep children in school	RCDE	1
Community buys motorbikes for supervision	LIA	1
Special needs facilities	LIA, UEWCA, SOS Sahel, MSCFSO, WCAT, ADA, APAP, EIFDDA, EWLA, Amudaeas, YMCCD	11
Increased attendance children w special needs	SOS Sahel, MSCFSO, LIA, EIFDDA	4
Increased access to school grants	EIFDDA, MENA	2
Support for poor/orphaned children	MSCFSO, KMG, VECOD, HIDA	4
Create school fence, protected school environment	CFID, ADCS, OWDA, KMG, MfM, IWCIDA, MSCFSO, WCAT, ODA, ADA, LIA, VECOD, EIFDDA, CF-AI, ADV, EWLA, Amudaeas, YMCCD, AFD, WAT	20
Remove alcohol/chat/shisha sellers or taxi stand from area around school	ADA, ASRO, UEWCA, EWLA, HIDA, YMCCD	6
Facilities for girls during menstruation	ADA, KMG, HIDA	3
Additional tutorials offered to combat illiteracy	MSCFSO, ADCS	2

<b>Changes</b>	<b>SAIPs</b>	<b>Tally</b>
Efforts made to reduce student drop-out rates	OWDA, NEWA, MSCFSO, WCAT, ODA, MfM, ADV, Amudaeas, ECC-SDCO, RCDE	10
Teacher residences constructed	ADCS, IWCIDA, MSCFSO, MfM, VECOD, MENA, Amudaeas, ECC-SDCO, RCDE	9
Teachers' facilities (separate toilets, staff room, etc.)	EIFDDA, UEWCA, HFC, MSCFSO, ASRO, MfM, MLYAM, Amudaeas, RTG	9
SA clubs in schools	ADCS, NEWA, HFC, ADA, UEWCA, OWDA, EWLA, MLYAM, ECC-SDCO, WSA	10

*\*Information from three SAIPs was not available at the time of writing of the report*